

Securing Compliance

A Principled Approach

KAREN YEUNG
St Anne's College, Oxford



• H A R T •
PUBLISHING

OXFORD AND PORTLAND, OREGON
2004

Hart Publishing
Oxford and Portland, Oregon

Published in North America (US and Canada) by
Hart Publishing c/o
International Specialized Book Services
5804 NE Hassalo Street
Portland, Oregon
97213-3644
USA

1177681

© Karen Yeung 2004

The author has asserted her right under the Copyright, Designs and
Patents Act 1988, to be identified as the author of this work

Hart Publishing is a specialist legal publisher based in Oxford, England.
To order further copies of this book or to request a list of other
publications please write to:

Hart Publishing, Salter's Boatyard, Folly Bridge,
Abingdon Road, Oxford OX1 4LB
Telephone: +44 (0)1865 245533 or Fax: +44 (0)1865 794882
e-mail: mail@hartpub.co.uk
WEBSITE: <http://www.hartpub.co.uk>

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data
Data Available
ISBN 1-84113-377-9 (hardback)

Typeset by Hope Services (Abingdon) Ltd.
Printed and bound in Great Britain on acid-free paper by
Biddles Ltd, www.biddles.co.uk

Contents

<i>Preface</i>	xi
<i>Abbreviations and Terminology</i>	xv
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xvii
<i>Table of Legislation</i>	xxi

Part I

1. Introduction	3
A. Competition, Competition Regulation and Enforcement	3
B. Regulation and Regulatory Compliance	5
1. Understanding Regulation	5
(a) What is Regulation?	5
(b) Conceptualising the Regulatory Process: Public and Private Interest Theories	6
2. Values and the Regulatory Process	7
3. A Public Law Approach	9
4. What Does it Mean to 'Secure Compliance'?	11
2. Competition Law and Policy	15
A. The Pursuit of Economic Efficiency Through Competitive Markets	15
B. Competition Regulation and Non-economic Goals	17
C. An Overview of Australian Competition Regulation	21
1. Why Australian Competition Law?	21
2. Australian Competition Regulation in Outline	23
D. Enforcement Discretion	26
3. Analysing Regulatory Implementation: A Principled Framework	29
A. Introduction	29
B. A Framework for Analysis: Regulatory Goals and Constitutional Values	29
1. Regulatory goals	30
(a) Efficiency	30
(b) Clarity and Predictability	33
(c) Flexibility, Responsiveness and Timeliness	34
(d) The Relationship Amongst Regulatory Goals	35

vi *Contents*

2. Constitutional Values	36
(a) Authorised by Law	37
(b) Certainty and Stability	38
(c) Accountability and Transparency	39
(d) Procedural Fairness or Due Process	41
(e) Proportionality, Consistency and Rationality	42
(f) The Relationship Amongst Constitutional Values: Rights in Regulatory Enforcement	43
3. The Relationship Between Regulatory Goals and Constitutional Values	49
C. General Themes	51

Part II

4. Quantifying Competition Law Penalties	59
A. Introduction	59
B. Theories of Penal Severity	61
1. Theories of Criminal Punishment	61
(a) The Deterrence Approach	63
(i) Penalties as Prices for Violations	64
(ii) The Injury to Others model ('Optimal Deterrence')	65
(iii) The Unlawful Gain Model ('Absolute Deterrence')	66
(iv) Enforcement Costs, Detection Rates, Risk Neutrality and Legal Error	66
(v) Some Strengths and Limitations of Deterrence-Based Theories	68
(b) The Desert Approach	72
(i) Desert as a Justification for Punishment	72
(ii) The Proportionality Principle	74
(iii) Strengths and Limitations of Desert-Based Theories	75
2. Regulatory Penalties and Penal Theory	77
(a) Moral Probity and Regulatory Offences	79
(b) Strict Liability and Regulatory Offences	83
(c) Hybrid Models and Regulatory Offences: Suggested Principles	85
C. Competition Law Penalties	90
1. The Australian Regulatory Framework	91
(a) The Deterrence Model	91
(b) The Desert Model	94
2. The Federal Court's Approach	96
D. Conclusion	101

5. Negotiated Penalty Settlements	105
A. Introduction	105
B. Bargaining in the Criminal and Regulatory Enforcement Process	107
1. Plea Bargaining in Criminal Proceedings	108
2. The Benefits of Plea Bargaining and Negotiated Penalty Settlements	109
3. Bargaining in Regulatory Enforcement: To Punish or Persuade?	111
4. Critiques of Plea Bargaining	114
(a) The Procedural Rights of the Accused May be Undermined	114
(b) Improper Pressure	115
(c) Inaccurate or Inappropriate Outcomes	115
(d) Invisibility	116
C. Negotiated Penalty Settlements and Procedural Fairness	117
1. Sanctions and Procedural Fairness	118
(a) Hybrid Sanctions and the Civil/Criminal Divide	119
(i) Why is the Sanctioned Conduct Considered 'Wrongful'?	120
(ii) What is the Social Purpose of the Law in Sanctioning the Proscribed Conduct?	122
(iii) What are the Consequences of the Sanction?	123
(b) Hybrid Sanctions and Procedural Fairness	125
2. Are Negotiated Penalty Settlements Procedurally Fair?	128
3. Negotiated Penalty Settlements: An Assessment	131
D. Safeguarding Settlements	131
1. The Enforcement Process and the Separation of Powers	132
2. Prosecutorial Ethics and Regulatory Enforcement	135
(a) Initiating Proceedings	138
(b) Charge Bargaining	139
(c) 'False' Confessions	140
(d) Penalty Agreements and Recommendations	141
(e) The Sentence Discount and Failed Negotiations	143
3. Judicial Oversight	144
(a) Penalty Agreements	146
(b) Admissions	146
(c) The Giving of Reasons	148
4. An Evaluation	149
E. Conclusion	151
 6. Regulatory Bargaining and Administrative Settlements	 155
A. Introduction	155
B. Regulatory Enforcement Tools, Techniques and Purposes	157
1. Regulatory Design and Enforcement Tools	158

viii *Contents*

2.	Compliance Tools, Techniques and the Pyramid of Enforcement	160
(a)	Regulatory Compliance Tools and Social Purpose	162
(i)	Court Imposed Remedies and Social Purpose	163
(ii)	Administrative Settlements and Social Purpose	165
(b)	The Dynamic Enforcement Pyramid and Constitutional Values	167
3.	Administrative Settlements, Responsive Regulation and Collaborative Compliance	170
C.	Bargaining, Adjudication and the Rule of Law	174
1.	Forms of Social Ordering: Bargaining and Adjudication	175
(a)	Adjudication	176
(b)	Bargaining and Negotiation	177
2.	Bargaining and the Rule of Law	179
3.	Regulatory Bargaining Between State and Citizen	182
(a)	Coercion and Consent	182
(b)	Regulatory Bargaining and Constitutional Values	185
D.	Conclusion	187
7.	Administrative Undertakings in Australian Competition Law Enforcement	191
A.	Introduction	191
B.	Enforceable Undertakings and Legal Constraints	195
C.	Remedial Undertakings	200
1.	Types of Remedial Undertakings	200
2.	An Evaluation of Remedial Undertakings	204
(a)	Remedial Undertakings as Regulatory Sanctions	204
(b)	Remedial Undertakings: Legal Principles and Constitutional Values	206
(i)	Proper Purposes	206
(ii)	Procedural Fairness and Proportionality	210
D.	Merger Undertakings	214
1.	The History of Merger Undertakings	215
2.	How Have Merger Undertakings Been Used?	216
(a)	Informal Clearance	216
(b)	The Nature and Content of Merger Undertakings	217
3.	The Benefits of Merger Undertakings	218
4.	Criticisms of Merger Undertakings	221
(a)	Ineffective	221
(b)	Unfairness	223
(c)	Excessive Discretion	226
5.	An Evaluation of Merger Undertakings	231
(a)	US Antitrust Law	233

(b) EU Merger Regulation	236
(c) Evaluation and Reform	239
E. Conclusion	240

Part III

8. Conclusion	245
A. Introduction	245
B. Recurring Themes	245
1. Regulatory Goals and Constitutional Values	246
2. Discretionary Power and Regulatory Enforcement	247
3. Characterising Regulatory Wrongs	249
(a) Substantive Norms and Regulatory Wrongs	251
(b) Procedural Norms and Regulatory Wrongs	254
4. Finding the Right Balance?	257
C. Implications for the Future	259
<i>Bibliography</i>	263
<i>Index</i>	279